UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLORADO

Boyd N. Boland United States Magistrate Judge 303-844-6408

December 5, 2013

JUSTICE BY THE NUMBERS THE BUSINESS OF THE DISTRICT OF COLORADO: 2013¹

The United States District Court for the District of Colorado experienced a slowdown in trials in 2013, conducting 38 civil jury trials to verdict; nine civil trials to the court; 17 felony trials; and trying two petty offenses. This is a total of 66 civil and criminal trials, down from 91 total trials in 2012, or a decrease of 28%. The business of the court is reported below.

I. CIVIL JURY TRIALS

A. Overview

Thirty-eight civil cases were tried to jury verdicts in 2013, while 3,233 civil actions have been filed. The ratio of cases tried to cases filed is 1.17%.

The comparison is imprecise because none of the cases tried in 2013 was filed then. The date of filing of each case tried to verdict in 2013 is reported below:

Year Filed	No. Tried in 2013
	•
2012	7
2011	15
2010	10
2009	3
2008	3

¹This report is for calendar year 2013 through November 25, 2013.

The average time from filing to a jury trial in 2013 was 28 months (2.3 years), which is unchanged from 2012. Three of the cases followed appeals to the Tenth Circuit Court of Appeals. When the cases subject to appeals are excluded, the average time to a jury trial was 26.2 months. The shortest time from filing to trial was eight months, achieved in two cases--a slip and fall and an FDCPA case. Sixteen of the 38 jury trials (42%) were tried within two years of filing. The longest average time to trial was MSK at 37.6 months; the shortest was BNB at 14.6 months. Although REB initially sets cases for trial not more than 14 months from filing, the average time to trial in an REB case was 23 months.

The number of civil jury trials in 2013 fell by 28% compared to 2012, when a record 53 civil jury cases were tried to verdict. The number of civil jury trials to verdict in each of the last twelve years is reported below:

<u>Year</u>	No. of Cases Filed	No. of Civil Jury Trials	Rate of Trials
2013	3,233	38	1.17%
2012	3,380	53	1.57
2011	3,136	30	0.88
2010	3,177	25	0.79
2009	3,042	34	1.10
2008	2,838	29	1.00
2007	2,726	36	1.30
2006	2,607	38	1.50
2005	2,679	35	1.30
2004	2,698	51	1.89
2003	2,672	47	1.75
2002	2,464	52	2.10

B. Verdict Amounts

Defendants faired particularly well in 2013, prevailing in 25 of the 38 civil jury trials (66%), while the plaintiffs prevailed in only 13 cases (34%). Rates of success since 2003 are reported below:

Year	No. of Civil Jury Trials	Plaintiffs Prevailed	Defendants Prevailed	Split Verdicts
2013	38	13 (34%)	25 (66%) ²	0
2012	53	25 (47%)	28 (53%)	0
2011	30	15 (50%)	15 (50%)	0
2010	25	13 (52%)	11 (44%) ³	1 (4%)
2009	34	15 (44%)	16 (47%) ⁴	3 (9%)
2008	29	12 (41%)	17 (59%)	0
2007	36	15 (42%)	21 (58%)5	0
2006	38	24 (63%)	14 (37%)	0
2005	35	23 (66%)	11 (31%) ⁶	1 (3%)
2004	51	25 (49%)	26 (51%)	0
2003	<u>47</u>	<u>26 (55%)</u>	<u>21 (45%)</u>	_0
TOTAL	408	202 (49.5%)	201 (49.2%)	5 (1.2%)

The largest verdict in 2013 was \$4,480,000 (in a breach of insurance contract case involving a fatal auto crash), and the smallest were \$1.7 The average verdict was \$533,306, and

²In one case tried in 2013, the verdict for the defendant included an award of \$39,076 on a counterclaim.

³In one case tried in 2010, the verdict for the defendant included an award of \$221,631 on a counterclaim.

⁴In one case tried in 2009, the verdict for the defendant included an award of \$5,350,000 on a counterclaim.

⁵In one case tried in 2007, the verdict for the defendant included an award of \$16,000,000 on a counterclaim.

⁶In 2005, there was one split verdict, with the plaintiff being awarded \$57,672 on his claim for invasion of privacy and the defendant being awarded \$140,520 on its counterclaim for breach of the duty of loyalty.

⁷Juries awarded nominal damages in two cases, one involving a claim for breach of an insurance contract and the other alleging employment discrimination based on gender.

the median was \$93,552. The following chart reports the jury verdicts in 2013 from high to low:

Rank	Amount	Type of Case
1	\$ 4,480,000	breach of insurance contract
2	1,382,000	breach of insurance contract
3	647,563	employment: retaliation
4	440,000	misrepresentation: LASIK advertisement
5	183,000	employment: retaliation
6	109,000	employment: disability
7	92,552	employment: public policy
8	40,000	civil rights: excessive force
9	39,076	unjust enrichment (counterclaim)
10	29,543	employment: disability
11	21,550	employment: retaliation
12	2,000	TILA
13	1	breach of insurance contract
14	1	employment: gender

Active district judges presided over 28 jury trials; senior district judges presided over six jury trials; and magistrate judges presided over four jury trials.

A breakdown of the trials by presiding judge follows:

Judge	Type of Case	Prevailing Party	Amount of Verdict
MSK	employment: retaliation employment: retaliation employment: gender	P P D	\$183,000 21,550
REB	civil rights: excessive force civil rights: excessive force employment: retaliation misrepresentation (appraisal)	P D D	40,000
PAB	breach of insurance contract breach of insurance contract employment: gender employment: age civil rights: deliberate indifference negligence: medical malpractice premises liability: slip & fall	P D P D D D	1,382,000 1
СМА	employment: retaliation employment: disability employment: public policy breach of insurance contract civil rights: illegal search	P P P D	647,563 29,543 92,552
WJM	employment: disability employment: disability breach of insurance contract assault & battery (workplace) premises liability: slip & fall	P D D D	109,000
RBJ	unjust enrichment (counterclaim) employment: disability civil rights: excessive force antitrust	D D D	39,076
RPM	misrepresentation: LASIK advertisement breach of insurance contract employment: race premises liability: slip & fall EMTALA	P P D D	440,000 1
WYD	1. negligence: auto accident	D	
BNB	breach of insurance contract TILA FDCPA	P P D	4,480,948 2,000
KLM	1. civil rights: 1st Amendment	D	

The civil jury trials in 2013 consumed 190 trial days. The longest trial lasted 19 days, and the shortest were two days each (five cases). The average trial length was five days. The

most common trial length was four days (13 cases).

The judge conducting the longest trials on average was RBJ at 7.75 days per trial. This may be explained by the fact that he allows jurors to ask questions of witnesses.

C. Analysis by Nature of the Claim

The jury trials conducted in 2013 fall into five categories based on the nature of the plaintiff's claim:

Category	No. of Cases	% of Cases Tried
employment	13	34%
common law torts	8	21
breach of contract	7	18
civil rights	6	16
misc. federal statutes	4	- 11

At least 23 of the 38 (60.5%) cases tried involved claims which permitted the award of attorneys fees to the prevailing plaintiff. The plaintiffs won eight of the 23 qualifying cases (35%). The court awarded attorneys fees of \$34,230 in a TILA case. One case settled while the attorneys fee issue was pending. Requests for attorneys fees are pending in five cases.

Costs were awarded in 20 cases: nine times to plaintiffs and eleven times to defendants. The average cost award to plaintiffs was \$6,551, and the average award to defendants was \$9,726. The largest cost award was \$44,806 to the defendant in a breach of insurance contract case.

1. Employment

Thirteen of the 38 jury trials (34%) involved employment claims. The plaintiffs prevailed in seven of the 13 (54%). The results by nature of the alleged discrimination are reported below:

Nature of Claim		Prevailing Party	Verdict
age		D	••
disability	1. 2. 3. 4.	P P D D	\$109,000 29,543
gender	1. 2.	P D	
public policy		P	92,552
race		D	
retaliation	1. 2. 3. 4.	P P P D	647,563 183,000 21,550

In the last twelve years, 151 employment cases have been tried to verdict. The employment claims most frequently tried involve retaliation (38) and gender (34). The plaintiffs prevailed in 71 employment cases (47%), and the defendants prevailed in 80 cases (53%).

The historical verdicts rendered by nature of the claim asserted over the past twelve years are reported below:

Nature of Claim	Cases Tried	Cases Won by Plaintiffs	Plaintiffs' Success Rate	Average Verdict
retaliation	38	25	66%	\$257,311
gender	34	14	41%	484,016
race/national origin	24	6	25%	680,636
disability	23	12	52%	959,887
age	11	3	27%	342,832
public employee	9	4	50%	414,681
religion	2	2	100%	535,000
public policy violation	5	3	60%	328,765
luring	1	0	0%	••
breach of contract	4	2	50%	140,001
TOTAL	151	71	47%	414,313

The 71 cases tried to plaintiffs' verdicts in the last twelve years have resulted in awards totaling \$43,211,618.

2. Common Law Torts

Eight of the 38 jury trials to verdict (21%) involved common law tort claims. Two alleged negligence; three involved premises liability based on slips and falls; two involved misrepresentations; and one alleged assault and battery (in the workplace). The plaintiff prevailed in only one tort case, involving misrepresentations in connection with a LASIK surgery advertisement.

The tort claims, by category, are specified below:

Nature of Claim	Prevailing Party	Amount of Verdict
negligence 1. medical malpractice 2. automobile accident	D D	
slip and fall 1. 2. 3.	D D D	
misrepresentation 1. LASIK ad 2. appraisal	P D	\$440,000
assault & battery (workplace)	D -	

In the LASIK ad case, the jury awarded the plaintiffs damages of \$440,000 but also found that a non-party was 85% at fault. The judgment entered in favor of the plaintiffs was reduced by 85% to \$66,030.

Seventy-one negligence cases have been tried to verdict in the last twelve years. The plaintiffs prevailed in 35 of them (49%), and the defendants prevailed in the remaining 36 (51%). The total amount of damages awarded to plaintiffs in negligence cases over the last twelve years is \$61,158,312. Significantly, although 12 medical malpractice cases have been tried to verdict, the plaintiff has never prevailed.

The historical verdicts by nature of the claim asserted over the last twelve years are reported below:

Nature of Claim	Cases Tried	Cases Won by Plaintiffs	Plaintiffs' Success Rate	Average Verdict
personal injury (n.o.s.)	18	13	72%	\$1,804,120
product liability	18	10	56%	3,237,237
medical malpractice	12	0	0%	••
ski accidents	8	5	62.5%	571,566
auto accidents	8	5	62.5%	477,911
premises liability	5	1	20%	85,000
property damage	2	1	50%	0
TOTAL	71	35	49%	1,747,380

3. Breach of Contract

Seven of the 38 trials (18%) involved claims for breach of contract. Five alleged breach of insurance contracts; one claimed breach of a construction contract; and one defendant asserted a counterclaim for unjust enrichment. The plaintiffs prevailed in two breach of insurance contract cases, leading to the two largest verdicts of the year--\$4,480,948 and \$1,382,000 respectively. The plaintiff prevailed in the construction contract case, but was awarded only nominal damages of \$1. A defendant prevailed on its unjust enrichment counterclaim and was awarded \$39,076. The results are reported below:

Nature of Claim	Prevailing Party	Amount of Verdict
breach of insurance contract		
1.	P	\$4,480,948
2.	P	1,382,000
3.	D	
4.	D	
5.	D	
breach of construction contract	Р	1
unjust enrichment (counterclaim)	D	39,076

The average verdict for breach of contract was \$1,475,506.

In one case, involving a plaintiff's verdict for breach of an insurance contract, the jury awarded the plaintiff \$1,382,000. The trial judge reduced the verdict to \$750,000, the limits of the insurance policy. He then doubled the award to \$1.5 million based on section 10-3-1116(1), C.R.S., which provides that a first party insured whose claim is unreasonably delayed or denied may recover two times the covered benefit plus attorneys fees and costs. The trial judge subsequently amended the judgment and increased it by an additional \$75,000, reasoning that section 10-13-1116(1) allows an award of the contract damages of \$750,000, plus a penalty of two times the damages (\$1.5 million), for a total award of 2.25 million.

4. Civil Rights (other than employment)

Civil rights cases (other than employment) accounted for six of the 38 jury trials (16%).

Three of the six cases (50%) alleged excessive force. One case each alleged deliberate indifference to a serious medical need, illegal search, and violation of the First Amendment. The plaintiff prevailed in one excessive force case and was awarded \$40,000. The defendants prevailed in the remaining cases. The results are reported below:

Nature of Claim	Prevailing Party	Verdict
excessive force 1. 2. 3.	P D D	\$40,000
deliberate indifference	D	
illegal search	D	
1st Amendment violation	D	

Historically, civil rights cases have been among the most difficult for plaintiffs to win. In the last twelve years, 72 civil rights cases have been tried to juries. The plaintiffs won 15 cases

(21%), and the defendants prevailed in 57 (79%). The largest verdict in a civil rights case was \$1,000,000, involving the unlawful arrest of a state judge. (That verdict was reversed on appeal.) The smallest verdicts were \$1 each. The plaintiffs' verdicts over the last twelve years are reported below:

Nature of claim	Amount of verdict
unlawful arrest	\$1,000,000
unreasonable search	190,000
excessive force	45,000
excessive force	40,000
cruel and unusual	32,002
excessive force	10,000
unlawful arrest	10,000
unreasonable search	6,500
unlawful arrest	5,000
cruel and unusual	2,000
retaliation: 1st Amendment	1,791
retaliation	1,500
equal protection	630
unlawful arrest	1
excessive force	1

The average verdict in civil rights cases over the last twelve years is \$89,628. When the anomalous \$1 million verdict (which was reversed) is removed from the calculation, the average verdict is \$24,602. The median verdict is \$6,500.

5. Miscellaneous Federal Statutory Claims

Four jury trials in 2013 involved claims under various federal statues—the Emergency Medical Transfer and Active Labor Act; Fair Debt Collection Practices Act; Truth In Lending Act; and Sherman Antitrust Act. The plaintiff prevailed in the Truth In Lending Act case and was awarded statutory damages of \$2,000. The defendants prevailed in the other three cases.

6. Intellectual Property

For the second year in a row, no case tried to verdict in 2013 involved an intellectual property claim. Historically, plaintiffs have faired exceptionally well in intellectual property cases in this district. In the last twelve years, 21 intellectual property cases have been tried to verdict, and the plaintiffs prevailed in 19 of them (90%).

The historical results over the last twelve years are reported below:

Nature of Claim	Cases Tried	Cases Won by Plaintiffs	Plaintiffs' Success Rate
patent infringement	8	8	100%
trademark infringement	5	3	60%
breach of non-disclosure	1	1	100%
piracy	1	1	100%
theft of trade secrets	3	3	100%
copyright infringement	2	2	100%
Lanham Act	1	1	100%

The verdicts in the intellectual property cases have ranged as follows:

Nature of Claim	Amount of Verdict
patent infringement	\$51,000,000
misappropriation of trade secrets	41,980,131
trademark infringement	15,199,936
patent infringement	14,320,283
misappropriation of trade secrets	12,719,176
breach of non-disclosure	9,340,000
patent infringement	5,350,000
trademark infringement	4,462,000
patent infringement	1,850,000
patent infringement	1,679,616
patent infringement	1,205,000
patent infringement	728,484
copyright infringement	511,910
misappropriation of trade secret	100,000
patent infringement	74,863
piracy	10,0008
copyright infringement	635
trademark infringement	82
Lanham Act	0
Total	160,532,116

The average verdict over the last twelve years in intellectual property cases is \$8,499,059; the median verdict is \$1,850,000.

⁸The plaintiff sought statutory damages only, which were awarded by the trial judge and not the jury.

II. CIVIL TRIALS TO THE COURT

Nine cases were tried to the court in 2012. The plaintiffs prevailed in two; the defendants prevailed in five; and two cases await a decision.

The average time from filing to a bench trial in 2013 was 33.6 months (2.8 years). This is approximately six months longer than the average time to trial in jury cases (28 months).

The average length of a bench trial was 3 days. The longest bench trial was six days in an employment case alleging race discrimination, and the shortest were one day (2 cases).

Two of the bench trials resulted in rulings on the last day of trial or within days thereafter. In the other five bench trials where decisions have been rendered, the judges took an average of 1.4 months after the trial to render a decision. Two cases remain under advisement.

The nature of the bench trials and their outcomes are reported below:

Judge	Type of Case	Time to Trial (mos.)	Prevailing Party	Award
MSK	1. breach of contract (counterclaim)	33_	D	\$217,596
REB	1. interpleader (life insurance proceeds)	14	pending	
RBJ	declaratory judgment: successor liability constitutional challenge to ordinance employment: race civil rights: 1st Amendment	16 11 48 22	P P D D	decl. of no liability ordinance unconst.
RM	Federal Torts Claim Act (postal vehicle)	19	D	
RPM	Fair Labor Standards Act	60	pending	
BNB	1. due process: city license	809	D	

⁹The action was filed in October 2006. The parties consented to magistrate judge jurisdiction in July 2011, and the case was tried in June 2013.

III. MAGISTRATE JUDGE UTILIZATION

A. Alternative Dispute Resolution

In December 2011 the court changed its policy concerning alternative dispute resolution (ADR). Prior to December 2011, the magistrate judges were heavily involved in ADR efforts. Subsequently, the involvement of the magistrate judges in ADR has dropped off significantly, as indicated below:

<u>Year</u>	Settlement Conferences	Early Neutral Evaluations
2013	100	15
2012	166	22
2011	475	
2010	592	
2009	718	
2008	622	
2007	566	

There is no indication that the change in the ADR policy has had an adverse impact on case disposition in the District of Colorado. To the contrary, over the past two years the number of cases filed has increased by approximately 1% over the number filed in 2011. At the same time, the number of civil cases pending per district judge has fallen by 5%.

Some settlements result in greater efficiencies than do others. In 2013, thirteen cases settled less than one week before the trial was scheduled to begin or after the trial started. Thus, although 47 civil cases proceeded through trial (jury and bench), thirteen of the 60 cases that reached the eve of trial settled before judicial determination. In other words, 22% of the cases that reach trial settle anyway. Last-minute settlements are an enormous (and avoidable) drain on judicial resources and the resources of clients.

B. Consent Jurisdiction

Consent to magistrate judge jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 636(c) continues to be underutilized in the District of Colorado. In 2013, the parties consented to magistrate judge jurisdiction in only 40 of the 3,233 cases filed (1.2%). By comparison, parties consent to magistrate judge jurisdiction far more often in some districts in the Tenth Circuit, as indicated below:

<u>District</u>	Consent Rate	
E.D. Oklahoma	29%	
New Mexico	21%	
Utah	14%	

Significantly, each of these districts has adopted a plan providing for the direct assignment of cases to magistrate judges, subject to the later consent of the parties--in the vernacular, the magistrate judges are "on the wheel."

The average civil caseload for each full time district judge in the District of Colorado on October 31, 2013, was 215 cases. If the magistrate judges were on the wheel and received consent in a proportion equal to the draw of each active district judge, the average caseload per judge (active district and magistrate) would be reduced to 116 cases. It seems apparent that the time to disposition for cases, by either motion or trial, would be substantially reduced.

IV. CRIMINAL TRIALS

A. Felony Trials

Four hundred seventy-eight felony prosecutions were commenced in 2013. Seventeen felony cases proceeded to trial. The United States achieved convictions in 16 of the prosecutions, resulting in a conviction rate of 95%.

The most severe sentence imposed was 660 months (55 years) following conviction of assault with intent to murder. The least severe sentence was time served in an illegal reentry case. Seven defendants convicted of felonies have not yet been sentenced.

Despite the Speedy Trial Act which generally requires that a felony defendant be tried within 70 days, the average time from a defendant's initial appearance to trial in 2013 was 13 months. Only one felony prosecution proceeded to trial within 70 days of the defendant's initial appearance--a case charging felon in possession of a firearm. The longest delay from the defendant's initial appearance to trial occurred in a case involving child pornography, which took 26 months to bring to trial.

The felony trials involved charges of myriad crimes. Three cases involved firearms; two charged drug crimes; two involved sex offenses; two involved assaults; and one each charged theft of mail, mail fraud, forced labor, illegal reentry, counterfeiting, threatening communications, fraud in connection with citizenship, and tax evasion.

Details of the felony prosecutions in 2013 are reported below:

Judge	Crime Charged	Verdict	Sentence III II III III
MSK	theft of mail forced labor	convicted convicted	1 year probation: \$1,000 fine 240 mos. (20 yrs.)
REB	1. assault	convicted	660 mos. (55 yrs.)
PAB	1. felon in possession	convicted	pending
СМА	supplying firearms counterfeit court seal failure to register; sex offender tax evasion	convicted convicted convicted convicted	41 mos. 2 mos. pending pending
WJM	1. threatening communication	convicted	pending
RBJ	felon in possession possession of cocaine with intent to distribute	convicted convicted	100 mos. (8 yrs. 4 mos.) pending
JLK	distribution of methamphetamine unlawful procurement of citizenship	convicted convicted	137 mos. (11 yrs. 5 mos.) pending
WYD	illegal reentry child pornography assault of federal officer	convicted convicted acquitted	time served pending
DME	1. mail fraud	convicted	72 mos. (6 yrs.)

Trial of the 17 felony cases consumed a total of 71 days, for an average of 4.2 days per trial. By comparison, trial of 38 civil jury trials consumed 190 trial days, with an average of five days per trial.

B. Petty Offense Trials

The magistrate judges conducted two petty offense trials. One case charged damage to forest land and the other charged assault. Both resulted in convictions.

V. CONCLUSION

The judges of the District of Colorado conducted 38 civil jury trials, with plaintiffs prevailing in 13 trials (34%) and defendants prevailing in 25 trials (66%). Only three of the civil jury trials were tried by magistrate judges on the consent of the parties. The judges conducted

nine bench trials, with the plaintiffs prevailing in two, the defendants prevailing in five, and two awaiting decision. One bench trial was to a magistrate judge. District judges tried 17 felony cases, with a conviction rate of 95%. Meanwhile, the magistrate judges tried two petty offenses, both resulting in convictions.